Can Improvements In Design of Mobile Plant Improve Safety Outcomes in the Mining Sector

Darryl Casey

New Penalties

Victorian OHS Act (2004) penalties apply from July 2006

- Designers \$50,000 to \$180,000
- Manufacturers, Suppliers, Construction \$900,000
- Employers \$900,000
- Queensland is Currently reviewing it's provisions

Industry History

- Australian Mining contributes fifty percent of all export earning
- Since early 1970's enormous growth in the Industry has seen the quadrupling in the size & complexity of mobile mining equipment
- Comparatively the Industry has a high death rate

Recent Studies

- NOHSC Coroners study (2004)compared two 4 year periods relating to fatalities in the Mining Industry (89 – 92) & (98-02)
- MISHC study (2005) on QLD Coal Industry
- NIOSH(US Bureau Mines) (1988)
- Up to 50% of the primary & secondary factors relating to fatalities were linked to design errors in mobile equipment

Industry Fatality History

Australian Mining Industry Fatalities 1992 - 2005



Source: Minerals Council of Australia

Define Mobile Equipment in Mining

European Standard EN 292 Safety of Machinery Defines mobile plant as: An assembly of linked parts or components, at least one of which moves, for a specific application for the processing, treatment, moving, or packaging of a material. Multiple of machines becomes a machinery system



Truck & Shovel Fleet











Design & Legal Duties

 Design is a plan of action to reach a goal. The plan ,is used by engineers, designers, drafters, scientists, technologists (Chalk 2004)

Duties of designers:

 A person who designs a machine ought to reasonable know, that the machine or part of that machine is to be used as a workplace and its design must be safe and without risk to the health of the person using it. The Problem with Compliance of Designers, Manufactures & Suppliers

- Historic short coming in Legislation
- Assumes equipment is properly used by operators (When Properly Used)
- Unsafe Act or Unsafe Condition to blame
- Supplier instructions for proper use to wide
- Minimal Manufacturer life cycle liability
- "Use At Work" excludes Storage, carriage & processing

The Problem with Compliance of Designers, Manufactures & Suppliers

- The Designers perspective is not always aligned with purchaser's perspective and how the equipment needs to be used by the operator and maintainers
- Legislation does not require the involvement of the end user
- Ashton University (UK) Study of EU Machinery Directives only 62% compliance in Manufacturing Plant
- Gulf of Execution between the user & the equipment (Reason & Hobbs 2003)



Gulf of Execution Not sure what we should do to the system to make it achieve our goals

Gulf of Evaluation Not sure what changes our actions have brought about within the system

→EQUIPMENT

Design Evaluation (Reason & Hobbs 2003)

Problems for End Users

Maintenance Operator

Machine Operator

- Access & Egress
- Confined Spaces
- Falling from heights
- Manual Handling
- Electrical Hazards

- Traffic Management
- Fatigue
- Ergonomics
- Noise & Vibration
- Equipment impact

Design Evaluation: Poor Execution & Evaluation between User & Equipment

Problems with Equipment

- Poor original design or redesign
- Control-display layout
- Unguarded moving parts
- Restricted visibility
- Exposed wiring and hot surfaces
- Exposed sharp surfaces or pinch points

The report concludes the typical engineer does not consider human factors when designing (NIOSH 1988)

Case Studies

Inspector Marsich v Race Industries P/L Recent fatalities in Victorian Mining Industries

- Death of a Driller
- Death of a maintenance employee jump starting truck
- Death of a maintenance employee by crushing



Drill Rod lifted into the rotary head while rotating resulting in a fatality.

What is good design for mobile plant?

Key principles of good design

- End User involvement
- Technical expertise
- Knowledge of the full process & working environment of the machine

Examples of the use of good design

- Quarry drill hydraulic shutdown
- QLD jig for Truck strut pin removal
- QLD overburden drill access modifications



Quarry Overburden Drill Hydraulic Interlock System Cost \$5000.00



Door deactivates all rotary parts when opened, can be seat mounted for deactivation



Truck Strut Pin Removal 28 kg



Pin Jig lifting device





Manufacturer's Design required detailed engineering changes



Vehicle raised lights, ROPS & aerial flag National strategies to improve design of mobile plant

- ASCC "Eliminating Hazards at design stage"
- NOHSC Strategy (2002 -2012) "Safe Design Guidelines"
- NSW Construction Industry (employ facilitators)
- QLD Earth Moving Equipment Safety Round Table (EMSRT)
- Worksafe Victoria Guideline flowchart



Preliminary Hazard Identification

Embedded Risk Management

Review Design

Identify Controls

Pre-Design Phase

Source known Hazards & Issues Source Industry Injury stats Source equipment standards

Conceptual & Schematic Design

Identify All Hazards

- -- Structure
- -- System of work
- -- Environmental conditions
- -- Incident mitigation

Industry Recognition

Industry recognised by

- WorkSafe Awards may provide contemporary examples of good design
- QLD Innovation awards
- Minex awards
- Fatal Risk Control Protocols recognised by industry result in standardised safety features.
- Hierarchy of control, engineering solutions
- State of Knowledge may make a legal argument in industry for change.
- Retro fitting is costly, design up front

Conclusions for Design Process

- Good design must firstly involve all parties in particular the End User
- Good design requires strict adherence to all standards and compliance
- Manufacturers must have life cycle responsibility for their products
- Government, Mine Owners, Unions must be proactively involved to ensure manufacturers suppliers, construction comply.
- Legislation regarding designers must involve the End User (Qld risk management approach)